

Kin 'make hay' as Judges shine

Pioneer

16th March 2007

Navin Upadhyay | New Delhi

Following the controversy triggered by the verbal duel between the two judges of the Gujarat High Court, the local bar council passed a resolution on January 23 seeking transfer of all judges whose relatives practised in the same court.

Advocate Code No.	Name of the Advocate	Related to	No of cases till Dec 2006	Year of practice started
364	Sr. Advocate S K Jhaveri	F/o Justice K S Jhaveri	1450	1957
529	Sr. Advocate J M Panchal	B/o Justice J M Panchal	1177	1972
789	Sr. Advocate R N Shah	F/o Justice M R Shah	2856	1962
2372	Hriday Buch	S/o Justice C K Buch	1625	2001
2432	Mukesh H Rathod	S/o Justice H K Rathod	1887	2001
2436	Hormaz B Shethna	S/o Justice B J Shethna	123	1999
2935	Niyati K Shah	D/o Justice K A Puj	216	2003
3218	Debnaz B Shethna	D/o Justice B J Shethna	19	2002
3246	Manav A Mehta	S/o Justice Akshay Mehta	306	2002
3453	Shaili A Kapadia	D/o Justice A M Kapadia	433	2003
3456	S P Majmudar	S/o Justice P B Majmudar	2030	2003
3461	Harshadray A Dave	S/o Justice A L Dave	413	2003
3764	Hardik A Dave	S/o Justice A L Dave	162	2005
3836	D K Puj	S/o Justice K A Puj	95	2005
5284	P P Majmudar	S/o Justice P B Majmudar	207	June 2006
5308	Nachiket A Dave	S/o Justice A R Dave	3	June 2006

Pioneer investigation in performance of judges' relatives

The bar council's resolution came in the backdrop of Justice BJ Shethna's allegation of a conspiracy to "finish his judicial career" for indicting his fellow Judge PB Majmudar's son SP Majmudar for appearing in his father's court.

While the versions of the two judges about their January 11 face-off are contradictory, the controversy has highlighted the fact that even freshly enrolled sons and daughters of some judges got more cases to handle than established advocates.

Record with *The Pioneer* shows that sons and daughters of as many as 13 judges,, including both Shethna and Majmudar, were enrolled in the Gujarat High Court. A comparison between the performances of the relatives of the two judges makes an interesting reading.

Justice Majmudar's first son SP Majmudar enrolled himself as an advocate in 2003 and appeared in as many as 2,030 cases till December 2006. Justice Majmudar's second son PP Majmudar enrolled in June 2006 and within a short span of six months appeared in 207 cases.

Curiously, the two inexperienced Majmudars have outshone Gujarat's some of the leading lawyers like KK Vakharia, Sharad B Vakil and Sudhir Nanavati.

Vakharia handed 182 cases between 2000 and 2006, Vakil appeared in 182 cases during the same period and Nanavati in 227 cases.

Similarly, sons and daughter of three other judges who enrolled themselves along with SP Majmudar in 2003, handled far less cases. For example, Justice AM Kapadia's daughter Shaili Kapadia appeared in 433 cases, Justice AL Dave's son HA Dave in 413 cases and Justice KA Puj's daughter Niyati K Shah in 216 cases.

On the other hand, Shethna's daughter Delnaz Shethna enrolled as advocate in 2002 and handled 19 cases till December 2006. Justice Shethna's second son Hormaz B Shethna enrolled in 1999 and has so far handled 123 cases.

Without attaching any motive, *The Pioneer* publishes the factual chart to highlight the performance of the relatives of various judges of the Gujarat High court.